TEAMSTACKGUIDE · FREE TEMPLATE

The Tool-Selection Scorecard

Nine questions, weights your team sets, and a score out of 100 for each tool, so the pick is one the whole team can explain.

By TeamStackGuide · Updated October 24, 2026 · 4 pages: how to use it, the scoring guide, the blank scorecard, and a filled-in example

How to use it

1. **Set the weights first**, before you look at any tool: 1 = nice to have, 5 = deal-breaker. Agree on them as a team.
2. **Score each tool 1 to 5** on all nine questions, using the vendor's own pricing and feature pages and a hands-on trial where you can.
3. **Total it**: multiply each score by its weight, add them up, and divide by the best possible total. The editable spreadsheet does the math for you.

The formula: score out of 100 = (sum of weight × score) ÷ (sum of weights × 5) × 100.

KEY INSIGHT
The weights are the real decision. Two teams can score the same tool the same way and still pick differently, because they weight different questions.

ACTION STEP
Write your must-have features on one line before scoring “Plan fit.” A tool that's missing one on the plan you'd buy scores a 1 or 2 there.

COMMON MISTAKE
Scoring the top plan while budgeting for the cheapest one. Score the exact plan you would pay for, at your real seat count.

PRO TIP
Score the same tool twice on two plans (as in the example). It shows you whether an upgrade is worth it before you pay for one.

WHAT YOU CAN SKIP
Three tools are plenty. You can skip scoring a fourth or fifth; narrow the list with our guides first.

Scoring guide: the nine questions

#	QUESTION	CRITERION	WHAT A 5 LOOKS LIKE
1	What is it?	Core job fit	Its main job matches the job we need done (tasks, projects, sprints, client work…).
2	Who is it for?	Team fit	Built for a team of our size and type.
3	What do I get?	Plan fit	The plan we would buy includes every must-have feature on our list.
4	Why trust it?	Trust	Security and admin features we need (2FA, SSO, permissions) are on the vendor's own pages.
5	What's different?	Edge	It does at least one thing clearly better than what we use today.
6	Will it work for us?	Adoption	Setup effort, learning curve, and integrations with the tools we already use.
7	What if it doesn't?	Safety net	Free plan or trial, refund terms, how to cancel, and how to export our data.
8	What does it cost?	Real cost	Per-seat price × the seats we would actually pay for, on the billing we'd choose.
9	How do we start?	Start path	We can move one real project in this week (importer, templates, guided setup).

Score anchors

SCORE	MEANING
1	Missing or a real problem for us
2	Works with a workaround we'd rather avoid
3	Does the job
4	Does the job well
5	Clearly the best fit we've seen

Weight anchors

WEIGHT	MEANING
1	Nice to have
3	Matters
5	Deal-breaker

TEAMSTACKGUIDE · FREE TEMPLATE

BLANK SCORECARD

Team: _____ Date: _____

QUESTION	WEIGHT 1–5	TOOL A: _____	TOOL B: _____	TOOL C: _____
1. Core job fit What is it?				
2. Team fit Who is it for?				
3. Plan fit What do I get?				
4. Trust Why trust it?				
5. Edge What's different?				
6. Adoption Will it work for us?				
7. Safety net What if it doesn't?				
8. Real cost What does it cost?				
9. Start path How do we start?				
Weight × score, summed				
Score out of 100				

Sum of weights: _____ Best possible = sum of weights × 5 = _____

Our pick and the one-line reason

First step this week

FILLED-IN EXAMPLE

Example: a six-person marketing team

The team is fictional, and the weights and scores are our illustration of one team's judgment, not a rating of the tools. Prices and plan details come from Trello's and Asana's own pricing pages, checked October 24, 2026; check them again on the day you decide.

CRITERION	WEIGHT	TRELLO STANDARD	TRELLO PREMIUM	ASANA STARTER	NOTE
Core job fit	*5*	*4*	*4*	*5*	*All three handle a content calendar; Asana adds goals and portfolios on higher plans.*
Team fit	*4*	*4*	*4*	*4*	*Six people, mostly marketers; boards feel familiar to the whole team.*
Plan fit	*5*	*2*	*4*	*5*	*Must-have is a timeline view: on Trello it's a Premium feature; Asana Starter includes Timeline.*
Trust	*2*	*3*	*3*	*4*	*Needs 2FA only; they confirm it on each vendor's security page before deciding.*
Edge	*3*	*3*	*3*	*4*	*Asana Starter's Timeline and Gantt views are the edge for launch plans.*
Adoption	*4*	*5*	*5*	*4*	*The team already uses Trello's free plan, so Trello needs no training.*
Safety net	*3*	*4*	*4*	*3*	*Trello has a free plan and a Premium trial. Asana has a free Personal plan (up to 2 users) and states it offers no refunds.*
Real cost	*4*	*5*	*4*	*2*	*Trello $5 or $10 per user/month billed yearly × 6 = $30 or $60/month. Asana Starter $10.99 billed yearly, sold in 2-, 3-, 4- and 5-seat plans, then steps of 5: 6 people buy 10 seats, $109.90/month.*
Start path	*3*	*5*	*5*	*4*	*Trello: nothing to move, the board is already there. Asana: the current board moves over first.*
Weighted sum	33	**128**	**134**	**131**	Best possible: 33 × 5 = 165
Score / 100		**78**	**81**	**79**	

Their pick: *Trello Premium (81). It adds the timeline view they need, keeps the board the team already knows, and costs less than Asana at six people. Asana scores close behind (79) and becomes the pick if Gantt planning or a larger feature set moves to weight 5.*

First step: *Start the Premium trial on the existing board and plan next month's launch on the timeline.*